

Table 1. Means for the Contextual Moderator Variables by CSR Model.

CSR Model	Number of Studies	Number of Observations	Number of Students		Years of Implementation	% Free Lunch
			CSR N	Control N		
Accelerated Schools Project	6	50	4,127	1,231	2.87	63.25
America's Choice School Design	2	27	8,922	5,655	2.17	
ATLAS Communities	3	8	2,289	509	2.43	
Audrey Cohen College	1	1	115	125	6.00	59.00
Center for Effective Schools	1	26	2,269	0	2.15	
Child Development Program	2	2	318	262	8.00	
Coalition of Essential Schools	3	6	666	115	4.75	31.63
Community for Learning	1	3	1,166	0	2.00	
Community Learning Centers	5	17	163	11	2.35	62.59
CoNECT Schools	5	42	5,487	4,927	2.58	59.83
Core Knowledge	6	58	3,591	3,220	3.84	49.75
Different Ways of Knowing	2	3	1,205	870	1.67	28.00
Direct Instruction	49	182	22,562	20,056	2.92	69.46
Edison Project	5	209	18,955	5,616	2.74	59.49
Expeditionary Learning Outward Bound	6	40	3,136	1,927	3.48	33.16
High Schools That Work	45	64	20,471	1,740	3.65	66.85
High/Scope Primary Grades	4	23	1,220	1,217	3.39	76.73
Integrated Thematic Instruction	2	2	49	45	4.50	
MicroSociety®	3	32	6,115	650	5.63	87.00
Modern Red Schoolhouse	6	23	3,979	2,213	2.65	81.00
Montessori	2	7	914	922	3.00	
Onward to Excellence	4	13	3,530	0	4.31	80.00
Paideia	4	5	1,442	643	6.00	
Roots & Wings	6	14	3,154	3,074	2.46	72.42
School Development Program	10	25	4,865	3,840	3.70	53.50
Success for All	42	173	18,523	17,820	2.56	81.46
Talent Development High Schools	1	2	803	870	1.67	
The Learning Network	3	38	3,741	102	2.00	64.64
Urban Learning Center	3	16	1,524	0	1.19	93.50
All CSR Models	232	1111	145,296	77,660	2.96	65.06

Table 2. Means for the Methodological Moderator Variables by CSR Model.

CSR Model	One-Group		Longitudinal Sample	Imputed Data		Categ.	Type of Outcome Data			Middle or High School Outcomes
	Pre-Post Design	Study by Developer		N	SD		Corr.	Means	Mixed	
Accelerated Schools Project	0.86	0.12	0.08	0.92	0.12	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.04
America's Choice School Design	0.52	0.52	0.41	1.00	0.00	0.56	0.00	0.37	0.07	0.33
ATLAS Communities	0.75	0.00	0.00	0.88	0.00	0.88	0.00	0.13	0.00	0.75
Audrey Cohen College	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00
Center for Effective Schools	1.00	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.58
Child Development Program	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.50
Coalition of Essential Schools	0.83	0.00	0.83	0.17	0.83	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.83
Community for Learning	1.00	1.00	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00
Community Learning Centers	0.94	0.00	0.94	0.06	0.00	0.06	0.00	0.94	0.00	0.35
CoNECT Schools	0.14	0.05	0.00	0.98	0.07	0.45	0.00	0.55	0.00	0.31
Core Knowledge	0.00	0.00	0.31	0.05	0.78	0.67	0.00	0.33	0.00	0.00
Different Ways of Knowing	0.33	0.33	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00
Direct Instruction	0.17	0.08	0.63	0.34	0.11	0.30	0.02	0.69	0.00	0.11
Edison Project	0.75	0.69	0.06	0.86	0.60	0.37	0.00	0.55	0.09	0.30
Expeditionary Learning Outward Bound	0.65	0.18	0.53	0.40	0.63	0.13	0.00	0.83	0.05	0.83
High Schools That Work	0.94	0.95	0.00	0.94	0.00	0.58	0.00	0.31	0.11	1.00
High/Scope Primary Grades	0.04	0.52	0.52	0.00	0.48	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00
Integrated Thematic Instruction	0.50	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.50	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00
MicroSociety®	0.84	1.00	0.00	0.47	0.16	0.38	0.00	0.63	0.00	0.31
Modern Red Schoolhouse	0.39	0.52	0.04	0.74	0.00	0.91	0.00	0.09	0.00	0.09
Montessori	0.00	0.00	0.57	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00
Onward to Excellence	1.00	1.00	0.23	1.00	0.69	0.31	0.00	0.69	0.00	0.54
Paideia	0.40	0.00	0.80	0.00	0.20	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.40
Roots & Wings	0.21	0.64	0.07	0.93	0.36	0.43	0.00	0.57	0.00	0.00
School Development Program	0.28	0.64	0.32	0.60	0.60	0.16	0.00	0.84	0.00	0.60
Success for All	0.06	0.45	0.75	0.38	0.08	0.15	0.00	0.84	0.01	0.05
Talent Development High Schools	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1.00
The Learning Network	0.79	0.13	0.29	0.05	0.26	0.50	0.00	0.47	0.03	0.13
Urban Learning Center	1.00	1.00	0.13	0.88	1.00	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.50
All CSR Models	0.46	0.41	0.34	0.56	0.29	0.34	0.00	0.63	0.03	0.27

Table 3. Summary of CSR Model Attributes.

CSR Model	Number of Schools	First-Year Costs ¹		Specific Curriculum	Specific Instruction	75% Faculty Vote	Parent Governance	Student Assessment/ Benchmarks	Ongoing Professional Development	High Developer Support
		Personnel	Non-Pers.							
Accelerated Schools Project	1300	\$13,543	\$14,585	0	0	1	0	0	0	0
America's Choice School Design	450	\$104,181	\$93,763	0	0	0	0	1	0	1
ATLAS Communities	105	\$8,334	\$93,763	0	1	0	1	0	1	0
Audrey Cohen College	16	\$78,135	\$89,595	0	0	0	0	1	1	0
Center for Effective Schools	1000	\$52,175	\$55,000	0	0	0	0	1	0	1
Child Development Program	165	\$95,675	\$65,000	1	1	1	0	0	1	1
Coalition of Essential Schools	1000	\$1	\$250,000	0	0	1	0	0	0	0
Community for Learning	118	\$78,135	\$85,428	0	1	0	0	1	1	1
Community Learning Centers	15	\$1	\$61,700	0	0	0	1	1	1	0
CoNECT Schools	198	\$1	\$612,582	0	0	1	0	0	1	1
Core Knowledge	1020	\$1	\$58,341	1	0	1	0	0	0	0
Different Ways of Knowing	600	\$1	\$87,512	1	1	0	0	0	1	1
Direct Instruction	300	\$52,090	\$202,110	1	1	0	0	1	0	0
Edison Project	136	\$13,023	\$72,926	1	1	0	1	1	0	0
Expeditionary Learning Outward Bound	93	\$1	\$84,386	0	1	1	0	1	1	1
High Schools That Work	1300	\$1	\$50,007	0	0	1	0	0	0	1
High/Scope Primary Grades	100	\$1	\$135,435	1	1	0	0	0	0	1
Integrated Thematic Instruction	1434	\$1	\$61,235	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
MicroSociety®	200	\$52,175	\$67,450	0	0	1	1	0	0	1
Modern Red Schoolhouse	110	\$1	\$223,988	0	0	1	0	1	0	1
Montessori	1000	\$159,723	\$780,000	1	1	0	0	0	0	0
Onward to Excellence	1000	\$12,502	\$62,508	0	0	0	1	0	0	1
Paideia	100	\$52,090	\$100,013	0	1	1	0	0	0	0
Roots & Wings	200	\$208,361	\$72,926	1	1	1	0	1	0	1
School Development Program	600	\$13,543	\$33,338	0	0	0	1	0	1	0
Success for All	1800	\$208,361	\$72,926	1	1	1	0	1	0	1
Talent Development High Schools	35	\$31,254	\$28,129	1	0	1	0	0	0	1
The Learning Network	200	\$52,175	\$32,188	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Urban Learning Center	29	\$10,418	\$165,647	0	0	0	0	0	1	0
All CSR Models ²	200	\$13,023	\$72,926	0.34	0.41	0.45	0.21	0.38	0.34	0.55

Note. ¹Median applied for Edison Project. ²All Reforms summary line is reform-level, not observation-level, and presents medians for Number of Schools and for costs and means for all other variables.

Table 4. Summary of Weighted Least Squares Regression Analysis for Moderator Variables Predicting Effect Size.

Variable	β	SE	Z
Constant	-0.21	0.28	-0.75
<i>Methodological Variables</i>			
Longitudinal Sample	0.09	0.04	2.40*
Means-Based Effect Size Formula	0.06	0.03	1.89
Standard deviation was imputed	-0.09	0.03	-2.72**
Sample size was imputed	-0.03	0.03	-1.52
Evaluation was conducted by the developer	0.16	0.03	4.87***
Study design was one-group pre-post	0.08	0.03	2.35*
Middle School or High School Outcome	0.03	0.03	1.12
<i>Reform Attribute Variables</i>			
Reform requires			
Specific curriculum materials	-0.06	0.06	-0.86
Specific instructional practices	0.01	0.06	0.24
75% faculty vote for adoption	0.05	0.04	1.34
Parent governance	-0.09	0.04	-2.32*
Goals and benchmarks	0.01	0.04	0.21
Ongoing professional development	-0.09	0.05	-1.71
Replication	0.00	0.00	-1.22
High developer support rating	-0.01	0.04	-0.20
Cost of reform: Personnel	0.00	0.00	1.17
Cost of reform: Non-personnel	0.02	0.02	0.95

Note. * $p < .05$; ** $p < .01$; *** $p < .001$.

Table 5. Weighted Mean Effect Sizes by CSR Model.¹

Model Name ²	All Cases							Comparison Studies						Third-Party Comparison Studies							
	N of Studies	N of Obs	<i>d</i>	SE	95% CI		<i>Z</i>	N of Studies	N of Obs	<i>d</i>	SE	95% CI		<i>Z</i>	N of Studies	N of Obs	<i>d</i>	SE	95% CI		<i>Z</i>
					Lower Bound	Upper Bound						Lower Bound	Upper Bound						Lower Bound	Upper Bound	
<i>Strongest Evidence of Effectiveness³</i>																					
Direct Instruction	49	182	0.21	0.02	0.17	0.25	11.61**	40	151	0.15	0.02	0.12	0.19	8.40**	38	146	0.15	0.02	0.11	0.18	7.82**
School Development Prog	10	25	0.15	0.03	0.10	0.20	5.48**	9	18	0.05	0.03	-0.01	0.12	1.57	5	7	0.11	0.04	0.04	0.18	3.23**
Success for All	42	173	0.18	0.01	0.16	0.21	16.57**	41	162	0.18	0.01	0.16	0.20	15.32**	25	85	0.08	0.02	0.05	0.11	5.08**
<i>Highly Promising Evidence of Effectiveness⁴</i>																					
Exp Lrning Outwrld Bnd	6	40	0.19	0.03	0.13	0.25	5.93**	4	14	0.51	0.07	0.38	0.64	7.50**	3	7	0.02	0.06	-0.09	0.14	0.39
Modern Red Schlhouse	6	23	0.26	0.03	0.20	0.31	9.25**	4	14	0.17	0.04	0.10	0.25	4.48**	3	11	0.21	0.05	0.11	0.30	4.12**
Roots & Wings	6	14	0.38	0.04	0.29	0.46	8.43**	5	11	0.35	0.05	0.25	0.46	6.68**	4	5	0.77	0.07	0.64	0.90	11.83**
<i>Promising Evidence of Effectiveness⁵</i>																					
Accelerated Schools	6	50	0.09	0.02	0.05	0.12	4.79**	3	7	0.21	0.07	0.07	0.36	2.93**	2	5	0.13	0.10	-0.06	0.31	1.33
America's Choice	2	27	0.22	0.01	0.20	0.24	20.84**	1	13	0.25	0.01	0.23	0.27	20.75**	1	13	0.25	0.01	0.23	0.27	20.75**
ATLAS Communities	3	8	0.27	0.02	0.24	0.31	14.76**	2	2	0.40	0.03	0.33	0.46	12.15**	2	2	0.40	0.03	0.33	0.46	12.15**
Montessori	2	7	0.27	0.04	0.19	0.35	6.55**	2	7	0.27	0.04	0.19	0.35	6.55**	2	7	0.27	0.04	0.19	0.35	6.55**
Paideia	4	5	0.30	0.12	0.06	0.53	2.51*	3	3	0.57	0.18	0.22	0.93	3.16**	3	3	0.57	0.18	0.22	0.93	3.16**
The Learning Network	3	38	0.22	0.02	0.17	0.26	8.67**	1	8	0.33	0.04	0.25	0.41	8.18**	1	8	0.33	0.04	0.25	0.41	8.18**
<i>Greatest Need for Additional Research⁶</i>																					
Audrey Cohen	1	1	-0.13					1	1	-0.13					1	1	-0.13				
Cnter for Effective Schs	1	26	0.13	0.01	0.11	0.15	11.86**	0						0							
Child Development Proj	2	2	0.12	0.06	0.00	0.24	1.90	2	2	0.12	0.06	0.00	0.24	1.90	0						
Coalition of Esstial Schs	3	6	-0.09	0.04	-0.17	-0.01	-2.21*	1	1	0.24					1	1	0.24				
Community for Learning	1	3	0.15	0.01	0.13	0.16	16.49**	0						0							
Commnty Learning Ctrs	5	17	0.03	0.03	-0.03	0.08	1.02	1	1	-0.06					1	1	-0.06				
Co-Nect	5	42	0.04	0.02	0.01	0.08	2.48*	5	36	0.00	0.02	-0.04	0.03	-0.24	4	34	-0.01	0.02	-0.04	0.03	-0.31
Core Knowledge	6	58	0.03	0.02	-0.01	0.06	1.53	6	58	0.03	0.02	-0.01	0.06	1.53	6	58	0.03	0.02	-0.01	0.06	1.53
Diffnt Ways of Knowing	2	3	0.00	0.02	-0.04	0.04	0.04	1	2	-0.04	0.03	-0.10	0.01	-1.46	1	2	-0.04	0.03	-0.10	0.01	-1.46
Edison	5	209	0.06	0.01	0.05	0.08	8.68**	3	53	-0.13	0.02	-0.17	-0.10	-7.65**	3	53	-0.13	0.02	-0.17	-0.10	-7.65**
High Schools That Work	45	64	0.30	0.01	0.28	0.33	25.60**	4	4	-0.06	0.02	-0.09	-0.03	-3.44**	0						
High / Scope	4	23	-0.02	0.04	-0.10	0.07	-0.37	3	22	-0.05	0.04	-0.14	0.03	-1.22	2	11	-0.04	0.05	-0.15	0.06	-0.83
Integratd Thematic Instr	2	2	0.24	0.19	-0.13	0.62	1.27	1	1	0.92					1	1	0.92				
MicroSociety	3	32	0.29	0.03	0.24	0.34	11.11**	1	5	0.13	0.07	0.00	0.26	1.95	0						

